

## Minutes

### Covent Garden Community Association

Planning Sub-Committee meeting held on Monday, 28 July 2014  
at 17:00 at Covent Garden Community Centre (Shelton Room), 42 Earlham Street WC2H 9LA

www.CoventGarden.org.uk



#### 1. Attendance

**1.1 Apologies received:** Elizabeth Bax, David Bieda, David Kaner, Rhu Weir

**1.2 Present:** Jo Weir, Robert Bent, Shirley Gray, Selwyn Hardy, Gary Hayes, Christina Smith, Meredith Whitten

#### 2. Presentation: None scheduled

#### 3. Planning Applications & Appeals

	Address & Application No.	Proposal	Comments
<b>CAMDEN APPLICATIONS</b>			
3.1	37 Monmouth Street WC2H 9DD 2014/4334/P & /4443/L A1 retail/ <i>Shaftesbury; Rolfe Judd (agent)</i>	Alterations to the existing shopfront.	The CGCA welcomes efforts to return the shopfront of this listed building closer to the original 19th century shopfront, particularly those efforts that adhere to the Seven Dials Renaissance study (see p. 52), which the applicant refers to in the supporting documents. This includes raising the fascia and glazing height to line up with adjoining properties and resulting in a more accurate and better proportioned design.  However, as noted in the Seven Dials study, there are additional alterations that would more closely return this shopfront to its traditional appearance, namely (1) using a brass grille as a treatment for the ventilator; and (2) removing the obtrusive flood light fittings. The CGCA has no objection, provided these additional two alterations are included in the proposals.  Photo: <a href="http://tiny.cc/kt5gix">http://tiny.cc/kt5gix</a> Documents: <a href="http://tiny.cc/l1vajx">http://tiny.cc/l1vajx</a> Note: Listed building. Currently vacant.
3.2	Plaza Ticket Hall Tottenham Court Road Station (East) 2014/4705/P London Underground/ <i>London Underground Ltd.; Taylor Woodrow BAM Nuttall Joint Venture (agent)</i>	Submission under Schedule 7 of Crossrail Act 2008 for temporary works being a diversion of Charing Cross Road (CAM/2/5/1).	No objection See documents Documents: <a href="http://tiny.cc/3mgeix">http://tiny.cc/3mgeix</a>
<b>WESTMINSTER APPLICATIONS</b>			
3.3	Telephone Box Opposite 8 Duncannon Street 14/04470/FULL Phone box/ <i>Thinking Outside the Box; Miles Broe Architecture LLP (agent)</i>	Use of BT telephone box as 1no. self-contained retail unit (Class A1 use).	The CGCA strongly objects to this application, as we did with the previous proposals at Craven Street (13/10622/FULL). While recognising the applicant's intent to help the local homeless community, the proposals are wholly inappropriate. Red phone boxes are listed structures and turning them into essentially a fast-food stand is not in keeping with their special architectural and historic interest or with the character and appearance of the conservation area. The proposals would encourage litter, loitering and vandalism, creating a nuisance for local residents,

			<p>businesses and visitors. See CMP 2.13 and 2.14.</p> <p>In addition to objecting to this particular proposal, we are also opposed to the precedent that any approval would set, with the potential for these listed structures to be turned into essentially vending machines. While we recognise that these British landmarks no longer serve their original purpose, these proposals are not an appropriate use.</p> <p>Photos: <a href="http://tiny.cc/Oy5gix">http://tiny.cc/Oy5gix</a> &amp; <a href="http://tiny.cc/nz5gix">http://tiny.cc/nz5gix</a></p> <p>Documents: <a href="http://tiny.cc/egxaix">http://tiny.cc/egxaix</a></p> <p>Note: Proposals relate to the second phone box from the right in the second photo above. Applicant received planning permission for similar developments in Brighton &amp; Hove, and Plymouth. Applicant previously submitted application for similar proposals at Craven Street (13/10622/FULL), but withdrew the application. On 09-12-13 agenda.</p>
3.4	<p>James Street 14/05327/ADV Various/Capco; Gerald Eve (agent)</p>	<p>Display of 3 rows of cross street elevated Christmas lights for temporary period each year, for five years.</p>	<p>While the CGCA does not object to the idea of Christmas lights in this location, we have several concerns regarding the particular proposals in this application and, thus, have no objection only if these conditions are included:</p> <p>(1) The proposed design of the lights does not fit with the character of the conservation area. Instead, we suggest the applicant propose a more tasteful design, such as that used in the Opera Quarter, just a few streets from this proposed site. This would also have the benefit of providing more continuity in the streets immediately adjacent to the Piazza. For example, see 14/04564/ADV (Westminster City Council document).</p> <p>(2) Many residents live in James Street and, thus, any use of Christmas lights must first and foremost respect their amenity. Residents already must deal with increased noise and disturbance during the Christmas season and should not have to put up with late-night light pollution from Christmas lights. Thus, any permission must include a condition that requires the lights to be turned off by 23:00 nightly.</p> <p>(3) Trees align both sides of James Street and no damage or harm should come to the trees during the installation or the use of the lights.</p> <p>Photo: See documents</p> <p>Documents: <a href="http://tiny.cc/pexaix">http://tiny.cc/pexaix</a></p>
3.5	<p>4 Upper St Martin's Lane WC2H 9EA 14/03600/FULL Tredwell's/The Gilbert Scott; Robert Angell Design International (agent)</p>	<p>Alterations to existing shopfront comprising of cladding of the shopfront, new sliding doors and new canopy and awning.</p>	<p>The CGCA has the following objections:</p> <p>(1) The CGCA objects to an openable shopfront, whether using folding or sliding doors, and we note that Westminster planning policy opposes openable shopfronts, as well, as stated in the Council's planning guidance, "Shopfronts, Blinds and Signs." Openable shopfronts detract from the character of the street and the Conservation Area, as well as the architectural integrity of the building. When open, they erode the appearance of the shopfront, creating a visual void, and can have a negative impact on local amenity, for example in terms of noise and disturbance. In particular, this premise has a license for live and</p>

			<p>recorded music, which would cause increased disturbance to residential amenity, as well as to those on the street, with an openable shopfront. The CGCA also notes that Westminster has consistently refused permission for similar request, including nearby on St. Martin's Lane. Note that there are residents directly adjacent to this property.</p> <p>(2) The CGCA also objects to the number of proposed tables and chairs. The drawings do not accurately reflect the layout and space available on the pavement at this site, which has consistently heavy traffic with pedestrians and cars going between Seven Dials and Leicester Square. The proposed tables and chairs would present an added obstacle because of the proposed layout, which has six of the chairs backing directly into the flow of traffic on the pavement.</p> <p>(3) Hours should be limited to WCC's core hours. Again, we note that residents live directly next door to this site.</p> <p>(4) The CGCA objects to the use of a neon sign, which is not appropriate in a conservation area, as outlined in WCC's advertisement guidelines.</p> <p>Photo: <a href="http://tiny.cc/rg6gix">http://tiny.cc/rg6gix</a>  Documents: <a href="http://tiny.cc/haxajx">http://tiny.cc/haxajx</a>  Note: Currently vacant</p>
3.6	41 The Market WC2E 8RF 14/05167/FULL Burberry/Burberry; Bauencorp LLP (agent)	Replace five existing roof top HVAC units with eight smaller units set behind an enlarged acoustic panels.	<p>While the CGCA is concerned about the increased number of HVAC units, we do not object provided that these units are indeed not visible from street level and that the planning officer is satisfied with the acoustic report, which states that no noise mitigation measures are needed to protect residential amenity.</p> <p>Photo: See documents  Documents: <a href="http://tiny.cc/5dfgix">http://tiny.cc/5dfgix</a>  Note: Listed building</p>
3.7	112 St Martin's Lane WC2N 4AZ 14/06569/FULL The Library (private members club/St Martin's Lane (London) Ltd.; Only Design Ltd. (agent)	Variation to Condition 1 of planning permission dated 20.01.2012 (11/08454/FULL), to substitute plans to allow alteration to minor internal layout changes to lower-basement, upper-basement, upper-ground, and first-floor levels; install a kitchen extract duct on rear wall, and extend the opening hours to M-F 10.00-00.30; SA, 10.00-01.00; and SU 12.00-00.00.	<p>The CGCA does not object to the internal layout changes or the addition of a second fire-escape door. We do not object to the kitchen extract duct on the rear wall, provided the neighbouring property, Premiere Inn, has been consulted, as there could be an impact on guests in rooms directly adjacent to the extract duct.</p> <p>The CGCA strongly opposes extending the opening hours beyond those currently permitted. These hours are granted with the understanding that the applicant must cease the licensable activity at that time. Allowing the applicant to continue carrying on for 30 minutes without a license does not meet the purpose or the spirit of specifying closing hours, and it also sets a dangerous precedent that could see all licensed establishments wanting to stay open for an additional 30 minutes.</p> <p>Photo: <a href="http://tiny.cc/lmggix">http://tiny.cc/lmggix</a>  Documents: <a href="http://tiny.cc/5eggix">http://tiny.cc/5eggix</a>  Note: On 15-11-11 agenda. CGCA's comments: No objection, provided the restaurant is truly used as a restaurant, as defined by WCC's Licensing Policy 2.5.3.</p>

			In particular, the restaurant should provide food in the form of substantial table meals prepared on the premises and served and consumed at the table; and, where intoxicating liquor shall not be sold, supplied or consumed on the premises otherwise than to persons who are bona fide taking substantial table meals and provided that the consumption of intoxicating liquor by such person is ancillary to taking such meals.
3.8	39 King Street WC2E 8JS 14/05548/FULL Palm Court/ <i>Shaftesbury &amp; Maxwell's Restaurant Ltd.</i> ; <i>Rolfe Judd (agent)</i>	Relocation and installation of plant at rear first roof level in connection with the existing restaurant at basement and ground floor.	<p>The CGCA has no objection, provided a condition is included that requires the applicant to comply with the mitigation measures laid out in the noise report. We note that the noise report says that there are several instances where the proposals will not meet WCC noise emission criteria without mitigation measures. These include:</p> <p>(1) that a canopy must offer full coverage of all plant items, such that no line of sight exists to any noise-sensitive windows, as the report states that residential windows overlook the plant location;</p> <p>(2) the canopy must be constructed from suitably specified insulated metal panelling and that the underside has absorbent treatment to prevent the build-up of reverberant noise levels;</p> <p>(3) that there is in-duct attenuation, as the noise report says that without this, the plant will significantly exceed WCC's noise emission criteria; and</p> <p>(4) that double gauge/thickness ductwork is used to prevent breakout noise levels becoming an issue for residential windows at the back of 39 King Street.</p> <p>Additionally, (5) the plant should be turned off when the restaurant is not serving, to further protect residential amenity. In particular, we point out, as the applicant does, that there is new residential directly above the restaurant.</p> <p>(6) The CGCA also notes, as the noise report does, that the applicant has not provided manufacturer noise levels for condenser units. A condition should require that these are submitted and approved by WCC before the works can begin.</p> <p>Photo: <a href="http://tiny.cc/pvfgix">http://tiny.cc/pvfgix</a> Documents: <a href="http://tiny.cc/2pfgix">http://tiny.cc/2pfgix</a></p>

#### 4. Tables and Chairs

CAMDEN APPLICATIONS			
4.1	63 Neal Street WC2H 9PJ 2014/4615/TC <i>Pix Bar/Pix No. 3 Ltd.</i>	3 tables and 12 chairs	<p>The CGCA does not object to the change in hours. However, we do object to the increased number of tables and chairs. The currently permitted number – 2T &amp; 8CH – are appropriate given the pavement width, obstacles in the pavement on this stretch of Neal Street, and the residential character of the street.</p> <p>Photos: <a href="http://tiny.cc/085gix">http://tiny.cc/085gix</a> &amp; <a href="http://tiny.cc/m95gix">http://tiny.cc/m95gix</a> Documents: <a href="http://tiny.cc/ykwajx">http://tiny.cc/ykwajx</a></p> <p>Note: Renewal. Change in use (current use 2T &amp; 8CH). Change in hours (current use M-SU: 12:00-21:00). Proposed hours M-SU 12:00 to 21:30.</p>

WESTMINSTER APPLICATIONS			
4.2	2A Garrick Street WC2E 9EB 14/05974/TCH Carluccio's/ <i>Carluccio's</i>	Use of an area of the public highway measuring 17.1m x 0.8m for the placing of eight tables and 16 chairs.	The CGCA does not object to continued use of eight tables and 16 chairs in the currently approved layout. However, as shown in the attached photo, the applicant is not consistently complying with the approved layout, as chairs are being moved to back into the pedestrian flow at this very busy junction. The applicant should be reminded that the layout must be adhered to as a condition of planning permission.  Photos: <a href="http://tiny.cc/rn6gix">http://tiny.cc/rn6gix</a> , <a href="http://tiny.cc/co6gix">http://tiny.cc/co6gix</a> & <a href="http://tiny.cc/vo6gix">http://tiny.cc/vo6gix</a>  Documents: <a href="http://tiny.cc/5mxajx">http://tiny.cc/5mxajx</a>  Note: Listed building. Renewal. No change in use or hours. M-SA 09:00-23:00; SU 09:00-22:00. Previous application (13/04961/TCH) on 24-06-13 agenda. CGCA objected because of heavy footfall and servicing trucks at Tesco's, and suggested a less-dense configuration.
4.3	10-11 St. Martin's Court WC2N 4AJ 14/06508/FULL <i>Café Koha/Café Koha; Meeson Williams Phillips Ltd.</i>	Use of an area of public highway measuring 7.5m x 1.4m for placing of eight tables and 16 chairs and use of the central part of the public highway in two areas measuring 1.2m x 3.5m and 1.2m x 7m for placing of 11 tables, 22 chairs and 12 screens.	No objection  Photos: <a href="http://tiny.cc/4k6gix">http://tiny.cc/4k6gix</a> , <a href="http://tiny.cc/ol6gix">http://tiny.cc/ol6gix</a> & <a href="http://tiny.cc/6l6gix">http://tiny.cc/6l6gix</a>  Documents: <a href="http://tiny.cc/a3xajx">http://tiny.cc/a3xajx</a>  Note: Renewal. No change in use or hours (M-SU 09:00-23:00). Previous application on 08-07-13 agenda. CGCA had no objection.
4.4	48 Charing Cross Road WC2H 0BS 14/06660/FULL <i>The Porcupine/Mitchells &amp; Butlers; Blake Morgan Solicitors (agent)</i>	Use of two areas of the public highway each measuring 2.25m x 1.65m either side of the corner entrance for the placing of two tables and eight chairs.	While the CGCA has no objection to the continued use of tables and chairs at this site, we are concerned about vertical drinkers standing outside the barriers and, thus, causing an obstruction on the pavement at this busy location adjacent to Leicester Square and station. The applicant should be reminded that all patrons are to stay within the barriers.  Photos: <a href="http://tiny.cc/q06gix">http://tiny.cc/q06gix</a> & <a href="http://tiny.cc/e16gix">http://tiny.cc/e16gix</a>  Documents: <a href="http://tiny.cc/r1feix">http://tiny.cc/r1feix</a>  Note: No change in use or hours (M-SU 10:00-23:00).
4.5	1-5 Catherine Street WC2B 5JS 14/06628/TCH <i>Four to Eight/Rossita Ltd.; CgMs Consulting (agent)</i>	Use of an area of the public highway measuring 1.5m x 7.7m for the placing of four tables and eight chairs in association with the use of the property as a restaurant.	The CGCA does not object to the principle of tables and chairs on the Catherine Street frontage at this site. However, we do object to the proposed number of tables and chairs, which would be too tightly packed into the space and invariably creep out beyond the permitted area. Thus, we suggest 3T and 6 chairs on the Catherine Street frontage. Under no circumstances should tables and chairs be placed on the Exeter Street frontage, which is much too narrow.  Additionally, the CGCA objects to the proposed hours. These should be limited to 23:00 to protect residential amenity, as there are many residents in the immediate area, including directly adjacent to this site.  Photos: <a href="http://tiny.cc/op6gix">http://tiny.cc/op6gix</a> & <a href="http://tiny.cc/sq6gix">http://tiny.cc/sq6gix</a>  Documents: <a href="http://tiny.cc/r3feix">http://tiny.cc/r3feix</a>  Note: New application. Proposed hours: M-SA 07:00-00:00; SU 07:00-23:00.

4.6	24 Charing Cross Road WC2H 0DT 14/06623/FULL Byron/Byron Restaurants Ltd.; Meeson Williams Phillips Ltd. (agent)	Use of the public highway measuring 8.7m x 1.8m for the placing of eight tables and 16 chairs on Cecil Court frontage namely, to extend the use for a further year.	No objection Photo: <a href="http://tiny.cc/9u6gix">http://tiny.cc/9u6gix</a> Documents: <a href="http://tiny.cc/s0fgix">http://tiny.cc/s0fgix</a> Note: Renewal. No change in use or hours: M-SU 11:00-23:00.
4.7	14 Garrick Street WC2E 9BJ 14/05503/TCH Lima/Mulato 8; Spectrum Property Consultant	Use of the public highway for the placing of eight tables and 16 chairs on an area measuring 9m x 2m in Rose Street.	While the CGCA appreciates the applicant revising the proposals to remove the waiter station and reduce the number of tables and chairs from 10/20 to 8/16, we maintain our objection, as the number of tables and chairs is still too many for this location on Rose Street.  The CGCA suggests six tables and 12 chairs would be more appropriate, especially given the residential nature of this quiet pedestrian street. We also note that the area will see an increase in residential units, should several large applications currently being considered by WCC be approved. Thus, the area around Floral Street and Rose Street will only see an increased intensity in residential use.  The CGCA does not object to hours ending at 22:00. We would object to anything later than that.  Photo: <a href="http://tiny.cc/5x5qix">http://tiny.cc/5x5qix</a> Documents: <a href="http://tiny.cc/xb37hx">http://tiny.cc/xb37hx</a> Note: New application. Proposed hours: M-SU 11:00-22:00. This is a revised application; was on the 14-07-14 agenda. CGCA objected.

**5. Other Business**

**6. Next meetings & future presentations**

- 6.1 11 August 2014
- 6.2 25 August 2014 (Bank Holiday – need to reschedule)